Comment to JATS 1.2d1

January 12, 2017

1. The use of @vocab and @vocab-term

A new set of vocabulary/taxonomy attributes, @vocab, @vocal-identifier, @vocab-term, and @vocab-term-identifier, are introduced in JATS 1.2d1 for elements, such as: <article-version>, <institution-id>, <kwd-group>, <named-content>, <role>, <subj-group>, <term>. Although we generally welcome the introduction of such attributes which we can use to semantically tag necessary terms in texts, we would like to suggest a few changes to those uses.

(1) <kwd-group> does not hold @vocab-term, and <kwd> does not hold @vocab. There can be cases where <kwd-group> and <kwd> have different vocabularies, e.g.,

<kwd-group vocab="dublincore" vocab-term="subject">
  <nested-kwd vocab="scientific name">
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="kingdom">Plantae</kwd>
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="phylum">Anthophyta</kwd>
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="class">Monocoty</kwd>
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="order">Commelinales</kwd>
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="family">Poaceae</kwd>
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="genus">Zea</kwd>
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="species">Z. mays</kwd>
  </nested-kwd>
</kwd-group>

or in nested expression,

<kwd-group vocab="dublincore" vocab-term="subject">
  ...
  <nested-kwd vocab="scientific name">
    <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="genus">Zea</kwd>
    <nested-kwd vocab="scientific name">
      <kwd vocab="scientific name" vocab-term="species">Z. mays</kwd>
    </nested-kwd>
  </nested-kwd>
</kwd-group>
This kind of expression is not possible under 1.2d1, because it does not allow <kwd> to hold @vocab. It is also conceivable that a <kwd> may need a special vocabulary such as a geospatial metadata system, which is not allowed under 1.2d1. We believe all the corresponding elements should be allowed to hold all four attributes, i.e., @vocab, @vocab-identifier, @vocab-term, and @vocab-term-identifier, equally.

(2) The names, @vocab-identifier, and @vocab-term-identifier
Throughout JATS, there are no elements or attributes which contains "identifier" in their names rather than "id". We wonder why the above two attributes use the word "identifier" rather than "id". If not a big deal, we prefer the word, "id".

2. <date-not-available>
(1) The name of this element should be <pub-date-not-available> to make more sense and improve understandability.

(2) Occurrence
For example, "%article-meta-model" states "(%pub-date.class;)+", and "%pub-date.class" states "date-not-available | pub-date", so that <date-not-available> can exist multiple times. This should be (date-not-available | pub-date+).

(3) Introduction of this particular element
We would rather prefer to not introducing such an element. If there is a way to express the absence of a pertinent publication date, e.g., using a fixed value such as "not-available".