Revised proposal for a review of ISO/TC 46/SC 9’s programme of work

At the May 1998 meeting of ISO/TC 46/SC 9, we discussed a proposal (document N 247) to review and restructure the work of the Subcommittee. Based on the outcome of that discussion, I was asked to prepare a revised proposal and terms of reference for working groups to examine the major subject areas of SC 9’s activities.

Since then, I have reconsidered my original suggestion to begin this review by establishing working groups for each subject area. This revised proposal recommends that a survey should be conducted under the direction of project leaders for each subject area. The feedback from the survey(s) and the reports prepared by the project leaders should provide a sounder basis for discussion and recommendations by working groups which would be convened at a later date.

1. PROPOSED METHOD OF REVIEW

1.1 Subject areas to be reviewed

For the purposes of this review, TC 46/SC 9’s activities have been categorized into the following subject areas:

- Bibliographic description and data;
- Subject description and data (possibly combined with bibliographic description and data);
- Document presentation;
- Information item identifiers.
1.2 **Summary of the proposed review process:**

The following steps are proposed for this review:

1) Assign project leaders for specific subject areas;

2) Conduct survey(s) to solicit feedback on the standards and future direction of work in each of those subject areas;

3) Collate the survey results into reports on each subject area;

4) Convene working groups to discuss those reports and make appropriate recommendations;

5) Implement the recommendations approved by SC 9.

1.3 **Decisions required from SC 9:**

Before the review process begins, the following decisions are required from SC 9 at its May 1999 meeting:

a) Approval of the process for this review, as outlined above or as modified at the May 1999 meeting.

b) Should “subject description and data” be handled as a separate category during the review or should it be combined with “bibliographic description and data” under the same project leader?

c) Is there a need to review the subject area for “information item identifiers” given that the existing standards in this area have been implemented and assigned to Registration Authorities?

d) Should there be one survey that will cover all of the subject areas or separate surveys for each of the subject areas?

e) What should be covered in the survey(s) of these subject areas? [Some suggested topics are given in section 3, below. If approved, the actual survey questions could be developed in an ad hoc meeting on the morning of May 20, 1999.]
2. DETAILS OF THE PROPOSED REVIEW PROCESS

Step 1: Assign project leaders for the review of each of SC 9’s major areas of activity

To be done by:
P-members and A-liaison organizations are to nominate experts to serve as project leaders for the review of each subject area.

Time frame:
Nominations are to be submitted to the SC 9 Secretariat by June 30, 1999. Project leaders will be appointed in July 1999.

Responsibilities of the project leaders:

• To assist in editing the survey for their subject area, if required;
• To collate the results of the survey for their subject area;
• To prepare a report and recommendations based on the survey results;
• To act as convenor of a working group meeting for their assigned subject area;
• To document and present the decisions of their working group meetings to TC 46/SC 9 for approval.

Step 2: Conduct survey(s) to solicit feedback on the use of existing SC 9 standards and the future direction of work in each subject area

To be done by:
The content of the survey(s) is to be decided by SC 9 during its May 1999 meeting with additional editing by the appointed project leaders, if required.
The survey is to be distributed by the SC 9 Secretariat.

Time frame:
The survey(s) will be distributed in August 1999.
Member bodies and liaison organizations are to respond to the survey(s) by October 31, 1999.

Step 3: Collate the survey results and prepare reports and preliminary recommendations for discussion by working groups

To be done by:
The project leaders in each of the assigned subject areas.
Time frame:

The project leaders are to submit their reports and preliminary recommendations by January 31, 2000. The SC 9 Secretariat is to distribute those reports to TC 46/SC 9 in February 2000, accompanied by the agenda for a working group meeting to be held in May 2000.

Step 4: Convene working groups to agree on recommendations regarding TC 46/SC 9’s work in the assigned subject area

Time frame:

The working group meetings are to be held in conjunction with the TC 46 meeting week in May 2000.

Responsibilities of the working groups:

- To finalize the recommendations to SC 9 about each of the standards in their assigned subject area and on the future programme of work in that area;

Step 5: Working Group recommendations to be discussed and approved by SC 9, followed by implementation of the approved recommendations

Time frame:

Resolutions regarding the future direction and programme of work for each subject area are to be taken at the ISO/TC 46/SC 9 meeting in May 2000 for implementation following that meeting.

3. QUESTIONS TO BE ADDRESSED DURING THE REVIEW:

For the ISO/TC 46/SC 9 standards in each subject area, the following questions should be addressed:

- Is there evidence of actual implementation of these standards?
- What purpose do these International Standards serve? Whom are they intended to help? Are the objectives of these International Standards compatible with the objectives of the group(s) that are expected to implement them?
- Do the standards address a real need for international standardization within their intended user communities?
- Would there be a negative impact if any of these International Standards did not exist?
• Are they actually standards or are they guidelines? If they are guidelines, would they be more effective and/or implemented more widely if they were published in another form (e.g. a Technical Report) or by another organization (e.g. an international association in the subject area)?

• Are any of these standards priced too high for their intended audience(s)?

• Are any of these standards out of date? If so, are the member bodies willing to commit resources to revise them?

• Should any of these ISO standards be withdrawn?

• If a standard is retained in the programme of work, is there a need to increase the recognition and implementation of the International Standard and, if so, what actions should be taken to do that?

• Is there a need for other ISO standards in the subject area and, if so, what might they be?

• In terms of future needs for standardization, is there a role for ISO/TC 46/SC 9 or has its role been superseded/supplanted by developments in other forums for reaching agreement on common practices and technical specifications in the subject area?

• Would it be productive to establish a permanent TC 46/SC 9 working group for the subject area? If so, are there available resources to support active participation in such a working group?

4. ISO POLICIES AFFECTING THE REVIEW

The following ISO policies should be kept in mind during the review of SC 9’s current standards and future programme of work:

• ISO’s strategic objective to ensure the market relevance of the ISO work programme and of published standards (see ISO/TMB Communiqué, no. 7, April 1999).

• The systematic review criteria for confirming an ISO standard specify that an International Standard should be withdrawn if it is not used either directly or indirectly as a national standard by at least five of the member bodies.

• As of 1997, ISO’s Technical Management Board decided that when a standard is confirmed at its first 5-year review, the second review is to consist of a vote at the FDIS stage. If that FDIS vote fails, the standard should be withdrawn (see ISO/TMB resolution 84/1997).

• The criterion for accepting a new project (including revisions of existing standards) is that at least 5 P-members must be willing to participate actively in the
development of that project. Working drafts or an outline of a working draft, as well as a nomination for project leader, must accompany proposals for new projects.

- ISO establishes the price of its International Standards according to their number of pages. For example: a 9-10 page ISO standard is assigned price code E at a base price of 54,00 CHF ($36.00 USD); a 19-20 page ISO standard is assigned price code K at a base price of 82,00 CHF ($55.00 USD). National sales agents for ISO standards then add their own fees on top of the basic ISO price.

- In general, ISO does not permit its International Standards to be made freely available via the Internet.

5. OTHER BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS FOR THE REVIEW

- Document N 266, which is a summary of the most recent systematic review results for each standard developed by ISO/TC 46/SC 9.
Annex 1
Standards within each of TC 46/SC 9’s major areas of activity

A. Bibliographic description and data

- ISO 4:1997, Documentation -- Rules for the abbreviation of title words and titles of publications. 11 pages
- ISO 690:1987, Documentation -- Bibliographic references -- Content, form and structure. 11 pages.
- ISO 690-2:1997, Information and documentation -- Bibliographic references -- Part 2: Electronic documents or parts thereof. 18 pages
- ISO 832:1994, Information and documentation -- Bibliographic description and references -- Rules for the abbreviation of bibliographic terms. 5 pages
- ISO 2146:1988, Documentation -- Directories of libraries, archives, information and documentation centres, and their data bases. 24 pages [ISO 2146 might be withdrawn as a result of the 1998 systematic review]
- ISO 7154:1983, Documentation -- Bibliographic filing principles. 8 pages
- ISO 10324:1997, Information and documentation -- Holdings statements -- Summary level. 31 pages
- ISO/DTR 11015, Information and documentation - Abbreviations of typical bibliographic words [currently being developed as a Web-accessible database]

B. Subject description and data

- ISO 999:1996, Information and documentation -- Guidelines for the content, organization and presentation of indexes. 47 pages
- ISO 2788:1986, Documentation -- Guidelines for the establishment and development of monolingual thesauri. 32 pages
- ISO 5963:1985, Documentation -- Methods for examining documents, determining their subjects, and selecting indexing terms. 5 pages
- ISO 5964:1985, Documentation -- Guidelines for the establishment and development of multilingual thesauri. 61 pages

1 All page references are to the English edition of these ISO standards
C. Presentation of documents

- ISO 8, Documentation -- Presentation of periodicals. 4 pages
- ISO 18:1981, Documentation -- Contents list of periodicals. 2 pages
- ISO 214:1976, Documentation -- Abstracts for publications and documentation. 6 pages
- ISO 215:1986, Documentation -- Presentation of contributions to periodicals and other serials. 5 pages
- ISO 1086:1991, Information and documentation -- Title leaves of books. 5 pages
- ISO 2145:1978, Documentation -- Numbering of divisions and subdivisions in written documents. 2 pages
- ISO 2384:1977, Documentation -- Presentation of translations. 4 pages
- ISO 5122:1979, Documentation -- Abstract sheets in serial publications. 5 pages
- ISO 5123:1984, Documentation -- Headers for microfiche of monographs and serials. 6 pages
- ISO CD 5966, Information and documentation -- Guidelines for the presentation of technical reports [revision of ISO 5966:1982 (22 pages)]
- ISO 6357:1985, Documentation -- Spine titles on books and other publications. 3 pages
- ISO 7144:1986, Documentation -- Presentation of theses and similar documents. 10 pages
- ISO 7220:1996, Information and documentation -- Presentation of catalogues of standards. 17 pages
- ISO 7275:1985, Documentation -- Presentation of title information of series. 2 pages

D. Information item identifiers

- ISO 3297:1998 Documentation -- International standard serial numbering (ISSN). 7 pages
- ISO CD 3901 Information and documentation -- International Standard Recording Code (ISRC) [revision of ISO 3901:1986 (4 pages)]
- ISO 10957:1993 Information and documentation -- International standard music number (ISMN). 4 pages [to be amended]
- ISO CD 15706, Information and documentation - International standard audiovisual number (ISAN) [new standard; in progress]
- ISO CD 15707, Information and documentation - International standard work code (ISWC) - Part 1: Musical works [new standard; in progress]